

1 REGULAR MEETING - ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS
2 CITY OF NOVI
3 Tuesday, November 19, 2024
4 Council Chambers/Novi Civic Center
5 41725 Novi Road
6 Novi, Michigan

7
8 BOARD MEMBERS:

- 9 Joe Peddiboyina, Chairperson
10 Mike Longo, Secretary
11 Siddharth Mav Sanghvi, Member
12 Linda Krieger, Member
13 Jay McLeod, Member
14 W. Clift Montague, Member
15 Michael Thompson, Member

16
17 ALSO PRESENT:

- 18 Elizabeth Saarela, City Attorney
19 Alan Hall, Deputy Community Development
20 Director
21 Sarah Fletcher, Recording Secretary

22 REPORTED BY:

- 23 Melinda R. Womack
24 Certified Shorthand Reporter

25

| | AGENDA | |
|----|--|------|
| | | Page |
| 1 | | |
| 2 | | |
| 3 | Call to Order | 3 |
| 4 | Pledge of Allegiance | 3 |
| 5 | Roll Call | 3 |
| 6 | Public Hearing Format and Rules of Conduct | 4 |
| 7 | Minutes - October 2024 | 4 |
| 8 | Public Remarks | 4 |
| 9 | Approval of Agenda | 4 |
| 10 | Public Hearings | 4 |
| 11 | PZ24-0051 | 5 |
| 12 | PZ24-0052 | 14 |
| 13 | PZ24-0055 | 42 |
| 14 | PZ24-0056 | 49 |
| 15 | PZ24-0057 | 65 |
| 16 | PZ24-0058 | 79 |
| 17 | Other Matters | 92 |
| 18 | Adjournment | 92 |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Good evening,
2 and welcome to Novi Zoning Board of Appeals.
3 Welcome to you all. Today's November 19 at 7 p.m.
4 Please stand.

5 (Pledge of Allegiance recited)

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
7 Please be seated. And turn off your cell phones
8 on the silent mode. And roll call secretary.

9 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

11 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

12 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

13 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

14 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

15 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

16 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Here.

17 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

18 MEMBER LONGO: Here.

19 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

20 MEMBER KRIEGER: Here.

21 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

22 MEMBER MCLEOD: Here.

23 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

25 Public hearing and format of the rules of conduct,

1 and approval of minutes of October. Somebody make
2 a motion for the approval of the agenda and
3 minutes of October. Any changes? Any
4 modifications? Somebody can make a motion.

5 MEMBER KRIEGER: I have an amendment
6 for page 11 line 20. It's not ITM, it's ATM.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. That's
8 it. Any other changes somebody can make a motion?

9 MEMBER LONGO: I move that we accept it
10 as suggested.

11 MEMBER KRIEGER: Second.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
13 Any nays? Okay. Approval of meeting of October
14 minutes and agenda. Any changes? Any
15 modifications on this agenda for today's meeting?
16 Looks like none. Okay. Public remarks. Anybody
17 have any public remarks on the hearing on these
18 changes on anything is the time to add your
19 things, please. Okay. Looks like none.

20 Okay. Once I call the case, the person
21 you can come to the podium and explain clearly and
22 spell your first and last name for the secretary
23 for the board record. And attorney, if you're not
24 an attorney you can take a pledge. And the public
25 hearing when it comes you're only allowed for

1 three minutes of time. We have today six cases.
2 First case I would like to call. PZ24-0051
3 (Citizens Bank) 41400 Ten Mile Road, on the
4 northwest corner of Ten Mile and Meadowbrook Road,
5 Parcel 50-22-23-426-009. The applicant is
6 requesting variances from the City of Novi Sign
7 Ordinance Section 28-5(a) to allow a ground sign
8 at 15 ft. In height (6 ft. Allowed, variance of 9
9 ft.); Section 28-5(b) (2)a. To allow a 50.16 sq.
10 Ft. Ground sign (43 sq. Ft. Allowed, variance of
11 7.16 sq. Ft.). This property is zoned General
12 Business (B-3). Is the applicant present? Please
13 go ahead and spell your first and last name
14 clearly for our secretary.

15 MR. DETERS: Good evening. My name is
16 Paul, P-A-U-L, Deters, D-E-T-E-R-S.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Secretary,
18 can you take the oath, please?

19 MEMBER LONGO: Are you an attorney?

20 MR. DETERS: No, I'm not.

21 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell
22 the truth in this case?

23 MR. DETERS: I do.

24 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Please

1 go ahead and present your case where we can help
2 you tonight on this case, please.

3 MR. DETERS: Sure. So as you may
4 recall, I was before the board last month and we
5 were presenting a case for 15-foot high ground
6 sign to replace the existing sign that had been
7 placed for many years at this location. And this
8 is -- the board had expressed some concerns that
9 the 15-foot high sign that we proposed was
10 excessive and had asked that we come back speaking
11 with the bank to downsize that and bring it closer
12 into conformity. So we resubmitted plans for the
13 sign that you see here, which is only ten feet in
14 height, as the board had asked. By doing that, it
15 shrunk the area of the sign significantly. So now
16 we're well under the proposed sign that we have is
17 about twenty-three and a half square feet if you
18 take it and box the entire piece in.

19 I'd like for the board to just consider
20 please, though, the text, the logo and the copy in
21 total is only five point eight square feet, which
22 is a fraction of what they're allowed to have.
23 And whereas I know that the community is trying to
24 steer away from pole signs or taller signs, I hope
25 you can see if the bank is willing to go with

1 what's in effect, six square feet of signs, it's
2 because the visibility of this sign is so much
3 better for them if it has a vertical orientation
4 like this does versus a standard monument sign
5 that can only be six feet tall. And the reason
6 for that is shown on that other slide that I had
7 up, which is -- and I'd like everybody to consider
8 where my cursor is pointed here, this little dot,
9 that green dot, that's the sign.

10 If we were to make it a monument sign,
11 it would have to go further back in towards the
12 parking lot to have a long, linear orientation and
13 it would be further into this cutout there.
14 There's vegetation or four foot tall bushes along
15 here and along here, and there's a severe slope
16 down into the corner there because there's a storm
17 sewer so the grade falls off significantly. It
18 would be extremely difficult to put a standard
19 monument sign in that area. So we're asking for a
20 little bit of relief from the board just given the
21 unique circumstances of this location.

22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
23 you, Paul. Would you like to add anymore things
24 on this presentation?

25 MR. DETERS: That's it.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Sounds
2 good. Thank you, Paul, for the beautiful
3 presentation. And from the city?

4 MR. HALL: Yes. Based on your comments
5 tonight, he's only seeking the one variance now,
6 just the height variance. He is within the size
7 tolerance so the variance is okay there. And
8 there is quite a depression for that storm drain
9 nearby, so that is correct. That's all. Thank
10 you.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you
12 from the city. Appreciate it. And correspondence
13 secretary.

14 MEMBER LONGO: We mailed out 27
15 mailings. No returns. There were no objections
16 and no approvals.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
18 Okay. Anybody on the public would like to speak
19 on this case before we go to the board? Any
20 comments? Looks like none. Okay, board. And
21 Paul, I know you came last time also you presented
22 the case and you came for the one variance tonight
23 on this case. And I open to the board to see
24 what's going to happen, and it's open to the
25 board. Okay. Dr. Sanghvi?

1 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. Good
2 evening. Please, there are people at home
3 watching this program and I'd like you to explain
4 to them what changes you have made since you were
5 here last month.

6 MR. DETERS: When I was here last
7 month, the sign that we had proposed was 15 feet
8 in height. There had been a 15 foot high ground
9 sign at that location for a number of years that
10 was hit by a car about a year ago and they had
11 just delayed putting it up to replace it until
12 their new logo came out. Once that came out with
13 the new sign ordinance, the old sign was no longer
14 in conformity. The board had asked us to see what
15 we could do to bring the height down and the area
16 down, both of which the bank has agreed to reduce
17 significantly based upon the request to the board.

18 MEMBER SANGHVI: Did you address all of
19 our concerns that we voiced last month?

20 MR. DETERS: I believe that we do -- or
21 that we have. Yes, sir.

22 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. Thank you,
23 Mr. Chair.

24 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
25 Dr. Sanghvi. Any other board member?

1 MEMBER KRIEGER: One other question.
2 If you could explain what S1 through S10 are.

3 MR. DETERS: Those are other handicap
4 parking signs and different things. It's a label
5 of all the regulatory signs, for the most part,
6 that go around. There are other signs that are
7 not related to this appeal. So it would be,
8 here's the pickup and drop off.

9 MEMBER KRIEGER: Those are approved.

10 MR. DETERS: Yes, those are approved.

11 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. Thank you. I
12 appreciate you going back to the bank and
13 discussing it. Thank you.

14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Member
15 Clift, please go ahead.

16 MEMBER MONTAGUE: I do appreciate you
17 working on this and getting the height of the sign
18 down. Thank you very much.

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Any other
20 board member, please?

21 MR. HALL: Can I say something?

22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please go
23 ahead from the city.

24 MR. HALL: He mentioned the extra
25 signs. The number is up there. He's coming back

1 next meeting to get these approved. So he's
2 coming back for those, just so you know. So those
3 are extra signs and he'll be coming back for those
4 variances, another case next week. So all those
5 signs you just pointed out, those additional
6 signs, we'll be talking about those next week --
7 next meeting next month.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you
9 from the city. Any other board member before I
10 go? Okay. From the city, this variance and this
11 height, is there any objection for the traffic or
12 anything, making left turn on the Meadowbrook side
13 how it is bad for the ongoing traffic?

14 MR. HALL: Yeah. There wouldn't be any
15 issues with the height of the sign there.

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Okay.
17 Thank you. And any other board member before we
18 go into the motion? Please go ahead.

19 MR. HALL: I'd just add one more thing.
20 So the variance, so just the request is now for a
21 ten-foot high sign and the variance can be four
22 foot variance because they're allowed six feet and
23 we go four feet. And there's no size variance
24 this time, so just the one variance.

25 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

1 MR. HALL: One more thing I wanted to
2 ask. Last time that we spoke you mentioned it was
3 lighted internally, is that correct?

4 MR. DETERS: This is correct.

5 MR. HALL: And there's no animation or
6 any flashing lights or any of that kind of nature?

7 MR. DETERS: No, sir.

8 MR. HALL: Thank you very much.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: From
10 attorney, want to speak on anything, please?

11 MS. SAARELA: No. Alan said what I was
12 going to tell you about the change in variance.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. I
14 appreciate it. Thank you so much. Before motion
15 anybody the final call on the board? Looks like
16 none. Okay. Member Montague, please go ahead and
17 make a motion, please.

18 MEMBER MONTAGUE: I move that we grant
19 the variance in case number PZ-0051 for a ten foot
20 high sign, four foot variance based on the
21 following. Requested based on circumstances or
22 features that are exceptional. It's a corner
23 property. Visibility is an issue. There is a lot
24 of existing plantings on the site which are a
25 benefit to the site in looking at the way of the

1 horizontal sign in terms of its visibility. And I
2 think those are the two that apply. To grant
3 relief will not result in any use of structures
4 that's incompatible with the adjacent surrounding
5 properties. It's a very commercial area with a
6 lot of signage.

7 MEMBER LONGO: I second.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
9 you. Roll call.

10 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

12 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

13 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

14 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

15 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

16 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

17 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

18 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

19 MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

20 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

21 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

22 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

23 MEMBER MCLEOD: Yes.

24 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion

25 carries.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
2 Good luck, Paul. Congratulations. Case number
3 two, PZ24-0052 (Catholic Central High School)
4 27225 Wixom Road, south of Twelve Mile Road, west
5 of Wixom Road, Parcel 50-22-18-200-026 &
6 50-22-18-200-027. The applicant is requesting a
7 variance from the City of Novi Zoning Ordinance
8 Section 5.7.3.A to allow the height of the field
9 light poles of 80 feet (25 ft. Permitted, variance
10 of 55 ft.). This property is zoned One-Family
11 Residential (R-1). Okay. Please go ahead and
12 present your case where we can help you tonight on
13 this case.

14 MR. TUREK: Good evening. Ed Turek,
15 President of Catholic Central High School. Ed,
16 E-D, Turek, T-U-R-E-K.

17 MEMBER LONGO: Ed, excuse me. Are you
18 an attorney?

19 MR. TUREK: I'm not an attorney.

20 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell
21 the truth in this case?

22 MR. TUREK: I do.

23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.
24 Present your case, please.

25 MR. TUREK: Yes. We're looking for a

1 variance for light poles, and here to explain the
2 details is Andy Wozniak, our civil engineer, from
3 Zeimet Wozniak.

4 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Please
5 go ahead and spell your first and last name
6 clearly for our record.

7 MR. WOZNIAK: Andy, A-N-D-Y, Wozniak,
8 W-O-Z-N-I-A-K, and I'm not an attorney.

9 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell
10 the truth in this case?

11 MR. WOZNIAK: I do.

12 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Andy, please
14 present your case where we can help you tonight on
15 this.

16 MR. WOZNIAK: Thank you. We're back
17 with this item. As you've stated, we are
18 requesting a variance for the height of light
19 poles. This variance was granted on March 14th of
20 2024. However, we did not pull a permit or start
21 construction within the one-year period, so we're
22 back with that. The position of the light poles,
23 which is here, here, here, here. There's six of
24 them total. Hasn't changed. The specs haven't
25 changed. It's identical to the last time you

1 approved this.

2 Under the review standards dimensional
3 variance, it's standard number one, environmental
4 conditions. There's a large state regulated
5 wetland on the property which greatly restricts
6 the placement of the athletic fields and the light
7 poles.

8 Standard two. It's not self-created.
9 Again, due to the limited space on the property,
10 the proposed fields are located to optimize
11 available property. Field lights are required to
12 maximize the use of the fields and to meet the
13 needs of the school.

14 Standard number three. Strict
15 compliance. The pole height impacts the aiming
16 angles, which directly affect the evenness of
17 light distribution across the field and potential
18 to spill light pollution. Taller poles allow
19 fixtures to be aimed more directly down on the
20 playing surface reducing the amount of light
21 spillage into unwanted areas. And you can see
22 this in this smaller area shows what a taller pole
23 accomplishes and a lower pole would have spillage
24 off to the adjacent properties.

25 Standard number four. Minimum variance

1 necessary. The proposed pole height is typical
2 for this type of use to maximize light
3 distribution. And I just want to point out that
4 this is light from the manufacturer's website, and
5 this is Novi High School, and they use the exact
6 same light poles.

7 And then finally, standard number five.
8 Adverse impact on surrounding areas. Sports field
9 lighting fixtures are provided with glare reducing
10 optics that are mounted onto an 80 foot high pole
11 to optimize aiming and reduce glare from adjacent
12 properties. The proposed pole allows for maximum
13 light distribution on the field while reducing the
14 foot candles to zero at the property lines. And
15 again, this demonstrates with a higher pole, you
16 get the lights shining down into the desired area.

17 And then finally, this is the
18 photometrics plan which you can't read, but the
19 study shows that all the property lines to the
20 north and west and east, that there's zero
21 spillage onto the adjacent properties.

22 And then finally, the benefits of this
23 proposed lighting system, for the players who want
24 to perform their best would be able to track the
25 entire field of the ball. For the neighbors, who

1 don't want glare in or around their homes or
2 lights left on when not in use, better for night
3 sky with bright uniform light directed onto the
4 field and not spilling above it. So we have
5 representatives from the lighting contractor or
6 the supplier, as well as Catholic Central, and
7 myself to answer any questions you might have.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. From
9 the city.

10 MR. HALL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
11 Yes, they are asking for a variance for 55 feet
12 for the lights. Could you come back to the
13 podium, sir?

14 MR. WOZNIAK: Sure. Sorry.

15 MR. HALL: On the map could you tell us
16 how many lights and where they're located?

17 MR. WOZNIAK: There's six total.
18 There's one here, here, between the two fields,
19 and then on the east side of the east field.

20 MR. HALL: So there's none on the road
21 or paths, just on the ball fields.

22 MR. WOZNIAK: Yeah. Just adjacent to
23 the ball fields on either side.

24 MR. HALL: And then 80 foot is a
25 similar height to other high school football

1 fields in the area. The lights aren't programmed
2 to have any kind of strobes or any kind of
3 animated effect, they'll just be lights for the
4 field, is that correct?

5 MR. WOZNIAK: That's correct, during
6 sporting events.

7 MR. HALL: That's correct. He did have
8 approval back on March 14, 2023 for the same
9 request. Thank you.

10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you so
11 much. Secretary, correspondence?

12 MEMBER LONGO: Yes. We mailed out 113
13 letters. Six of them were returned. Two
14 objections. No approvals. Two objections, one
15 was from Margaret and Sherry Dancy, and they say
16 my home is in the residential community near the
17 football/baseball field and their existing lights
18 shine annoyingly bright into my bedroom windows
19 throughout the year. And the other objection had
20 no comment, and that was from Yaya Yazza.

21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
22 you so much. Any public would like to speak, come
23 to the podium and spell your first and last name
24 clearly. Mr. Andy, can you step to the podium?
25 Please go ahead, ma'am.

1 MS. ROUX: Hi. My name is Christine
2 Roux, C-H-R-I-S-T-I-N-E, last name is R-O-U-X.
3 I'm a resident on the south side of the property.
4 When the request was originally submitted, there
5 was a barrier of approximately, you'd probably be
6 able to tell me better, but roughly 150 to 200
7 feet wide of trees and brush, mature trees and
8 brush that has since been cleared, which is
9 reducing the amount of coverage of trees to
10 surrounding areas. So the reference to City of
11 Novi's High School, there's in the one direction
12 the nearest residence is somewhere around 1,000
13 feet away from the field. The nearest residence
14 is literally on the other side of this road. So
15 the residences to the north are approximately 200
16 feet away. The residences to the west are
17 approximately -- the closest one is roughly 600
18 feet away and about 200 feet of brush has since
19 been cleared which is blocking protection. So
20 that's why I'm here tonight to go against it very
21 vehemently.

22 So I live next to the current football
23 field. There is currently issues with lights
24 being left on overnight with sound which is
25 obviously not related to this. So I guess my

1 first question would be, are there going to be any
2 sort of time shutoff sensors or anything that
3 would allow for the lights to be controlled
4 remotely should they be left on?

5 MR. WOZNIAK: Yes, ma'am.

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

7 MS. ROUX: Okay. Thank you. So I also
8 want to just mention that the views that were
9 shown in the packet that was proposed and
10 submitted for this show the old views before all
11 the brush and trees were cleared away. The brush
12 and trees that were cleared away stretch from 12
13 Mile all the way down here to the southern most
14 property line. So I'm in the Andelina Ridge
15 community. My house is down here. And so it's
16 not just one or two houses. Basically it's going
17 to create a issue for, I'll pull up my map. Okay.
18 So you can see there's my husband there at home,
19 but this is where the stadium is going to be. All
20 of these houses are going to receive light
21 spillage. This entire strip of brush has been
22 removed and cleared, which is reducing and
23 removing a barrier.

24 Additionally, one final thing I'd like
25 to note is while the 80 foot height is referenced

1 as being standard, in my research and consultation
2 with an independent lighting firm for high school
3 football fields, the standard tends to be 25 to 50
4 feet in height, and if we're looking at 25 feet
5 being the allowable within the zoning, and this is
6 80 feet, that's eight stories high of lights. And
7 that's going to create a lot of spillage when
8 there are neighbors in every single direction of
9 this property. So I guess I want to mention that.
10 And I have one other question for the lighting
11 vendors. So can you help understand -- or help us
12 understand the angle of the lights any sort of
13 barriers around the light fixtures that are going
14 to help direct the light onto the field and avoid
15 spillage?

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
17 Any other board member, please. Before we go into
18 public, any other public please? This is the time
19 where we can speak.

20 MS. ROUX: Sorry. One other thing is I
21 have spoken with my community, and while we don't
22 have others here, the sentiment is very strong in
23 support. At least a dozen other community members
24 have expressed similar concerns.

25 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

1 Okay. Now, please go ahead.

2 MR. TUREK: Can I address some of her
3 issues?

4 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Go ahead,
5 please.

6 MR. TUREK: First of all, we try to be
7 good neighbors. First of all, we apologize if we
8 did leave the lights on overnight. That was a
9 mistake. Happy to have our light expert come up
10 again and talk about the safeguards. We're going
11 to try to put in this new system. The lights in
12 our current stadium obviously are very old and
13 limited in what they can do. We're trying to put
14 in a new light system that's going to be
15 acceptable to everyone. So obviously, we
16 understand the concerns of the neighbors, but
17 being a lighting expert, my thought is we're
18 putting in the best lighting to keep the lighting
19 away from your properties for sure. Regarding the
20 clearing of the trees, if you want to address
21 that.

22 MR. WOZNIAK: So nothing's changed from
23 the last time we were here. The clearing happened
24 on the five acres that was owned by Catholic
25 Central. There's still a ten-acre park adjacent

1 to that and I'm not sure what additional trees she
2 was expecting to have, but those were all trees
3 that were going to be removed as part of this
4 development. And then we also we're building a
5 berm directly north of her house to also shield
6 the field -- to shield the field from her house.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
8 you. Okay. Before going to my board, she
9 mentioned that timing. Can you be on the podium,
10 please, Andy? Somebody has to be on the podium.

11 MR. TUREK: I'll stay here. But we're
12 going to have our lighting expert come and talk
13 about timing and anything to do with the lights.

14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please tell
15 your name clearly.

16 MR. HYMAN: Hi. My name is Robin,
17 R-O-B-I-N, Hyman, H-Y-M-A-N, with Matrix
18 Consulting Engineers.

19 MEMBER LONGO: Are you an attorney?

20 MR. HYMAN: I am not.

21 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell
22 the truth in this case?

23 MR. HYMAN: I do.

24 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

25 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Go ahead.

1 MR. HYMAN: Certainly referring to old
2 school football fields, the light was -- it was
3 generated in a blast, essentially, of a big cone.
4 This is Jefferson Barber with Musco Lighting, the
5 manufacturer of the actual fixtures. And with
6 modern LED lighting, it's amazing what they can do
7 in that they are able to direct the light exactly
8 where they want it to go.

9 If I could see the cut of the fixtures.
10 This will help explain some concerns. Yeah. So
11 what you have on the sides here, there's some
12 shielding that will prevent side spillage, but in
13 front, you'll never get a point source. So what
14 you don't want to have on the off side, she
15 doesn't want to look from her backyard and
16 actually see a point source. What these fixtures
17 do is they actually prevent that point source, so
18 you're never actually looking into an actual
19 point. What she'll see is a bright spot on the
20 field from, I'm sure from her house, but she won't
21 be having that bright spot.

22 With regards to the controls, these are
23 all -- I'll let Jefferson actually speak to these,
24 but they are automatically controlled.

25 MR. BARBER: My name's Jeff Barber,

1 Jefferson Barber. I represent Musco Sports
2 Lighting.

3 MEMBER LONGO: Jeff, are you an
4 attorney?

5 MR. BARBER: No, I am not.

6 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell
7 the truth in this case?

8 MR. BARBER: I do.

9 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

10 MR. BARBER: The Musco system has a --
11 has a control system called Control Link. Control
12 Link lets the end user, in this case Detroit
13 Catholic Central, schedule lights on and off
14 remotely. The on and off are controlled from our
15 parent company in Iowa via cell phone technology.
16 We will never turn lights on without having a hard
17 off time for those lights. So when the athletic
18 director schedules the lights to come on at a half
19 an hour prior to dark, the -- there will always be
20 scheduled what is the latest you want those lights
21 on. Typically, the athletic director will turn
22 them off before the latest, but they will go off
23 at a prescribed time. It's our goal to never let
24 lights on when they're not supposed to be. On,
25 and with our remote control and monitoring system

1 we very rarely ever have a light stay on
2 overnight. And the only way it would happen is if
3 the end user scheduled it to be on overnight or
4 they overrode the --

5 MR. HYMAN: It would have to be
6 purposeful.

7 MR. BARBER: Yes. He worded it
8 correctly. It would have to be purposeful to
9 leave it on overnight.

10 MR. HYMAN: With regard to the light
11 spillage, the calculations are accurate in that at
12 the property lines there is zero. The
13 calculations say that all things considered with a
14 normal night you will get zero light from this
15 property crossing the property line. That being
16 said, we can see stars millions of light years
17 away, so it's not that the -- the perception will
18 be there that there is light on that can't be
19 removed, but the actual measurement of light is
20 zero at the property level.

21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Any
22 other comments?

23 MS. ROUX: Can I ask a clarifying
24 question on the lighting controls?

25 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: There is a

1 three minute time limit for any public hearing, so
2 your time is done, and I'm sorry for that. Please
3 go ahead.

4 MR. HYMAN: Just to say that if outside
5 of this meeting if there are other questions, we'd
6 be more than happy to address them locally. But
7 obviously we can't address specific questions from
8 the public after that speaking time, but we'd be
9 more than happy to discuss it and help alleviate
10 concerns. There are certainly many examples of
11 these fixtures installed regionally, and if it's a
12 matter of presenting to.

13 MR. BARBER: For example, we just did
14 within the last three and a half, four years ago
15 we did Novi High School. Our product was selected
16 because of playability and the neighbors, the
17 concern with the neighbors. We're at this time
18 able to put lights in communities where we've
19 never been able to put lights before because of
20 our spill and glare control. Prime example is
21 Kalamazoo. They basically kept us out of
22 Kalamazoo College for years. When we introduced
23 this product, showed them, gave them examples, we
24 are now -- we now like Kalamazoo College football,
25 and the city did their own lighting tests on

1 property lines and were completely satisfied that
2 there's no issues with spill light and or
3 candela/glare.

4 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Any
5 other thing you would like before I go? Thank you
6 so much. Andy, please come. And before Andy, I'm
7 giving last final one minute of time for the
8 audience. Your name is Christina?

9 MS. ROUX: Christine.

10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Christine,
11 can you please come and explain only one minute
12 time, and this is the final time, please.

13 MS. ROUX: Yes. Absolutely. So I just
14 had two additional questions for the experts.
15 First of all, is there an end time or a cutoff
16 required by the city by which the lights would
17 have to be turned off? With that, would there be
18 an ability to dim the lights after play to allow
19 for everybody to safely exit but to dim the lights
20 lower than what's necessary for playing? And then
21 are there alternative heights and angles that
22 could still provide safe illumination for the
23 field that would be less than 80 feet?

24 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
25 you. Mr. Andy, would you like to speak anything

1 on that?

2 MR. TUREK: I'll let Jefferson.

3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please go
4 ahead.

5 MR. BARBER: So the lighting system,
6 the fields are lit to what we consider 50 foot
7 candles which is a very common high school
8 football lighting level, and at the end of play or
9 even during practice or times when they don't need
10 as much light for visibility's sake, there is a
11 three level lighting -- or actually two levels of
12 dimming. So we can dim it to 50%, which would be
13 25 foot candles, and then again down to 15%, and
14 that is a typical -- the typical use for that is
15 one, you can dim it down after the game is over to
16 let the fans know it's time to leave, and it gives
17 cleanup crews the opportunity to do their work
18 with not as much light so they're not on the wee
19 hours as they're clearing up the stadium.

20 MR. HYMAN: With regards to the
21 direction though, 25 feet is definitely not a
22 football or a field standard to properly light
23 this. Jefferson has a great example of when is
24 the light -- the sun the most irritating to you.
25 It's when it's low on the horizon. And so that's

1 what a lower fixture would do is it would put it
2 lower on the horizon and then make it certainly
3 much more visible from a further distance because
4 of this. Because we're angling the lights down
5 and focusing them on the source that we're
6 intending on illuminating. We're reducing the
7 glare off site. I know it's counterintuitive. It
8 is. It's just counterintuitive. But if you think
9 of it as the sun, the sun is most irritating when
10 it's low on the horizon.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

12 Okay. Mr. Andy.

13 MR. WOZNIAK: Yes.

14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Before we go
15 on to the board, would you like to add any on your
16 behalf, or do you want to move on to the board?

17 MR. WOZNIAK: No. I think we're ready
18 to go on to the board and I'd just like to remind
19 you this was granted before. Nothing's changed
20 since then. We didn't change one thing to the
21 site plan as well.

22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you for
23 your wonderful presentations on the team members.
24 And also I appreciate for the support members in
25 the audience. And keeping on this mind and this

1 school is very important and also the questions
2 are very important too. These are based on the
3 questions on the timing on the lights, timing
4 schedules, and make sure on follow that list
5 whatever it is. And also the height also you
6 mentioned 80 foot. Andy, can you be on the
7 podium? I really appreciate it. Thank you. Any
8 other things, my board members will ask the
9 questions and present it. It's open to the board.
10 Dr. Sanghvi.

11 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. I have
12 known this complex from the days of its inception
13 from the days of Father Elmer. And I've been on
14 that complex God knows how many times over the
15 years when he started. And I don't claim to be an
16 expert on lighting, but my main concerns are
17 basically three, safety of the players, safety of
18 the spectators, people coming in and out of the
19 complex, and equally important is the interference
20 with the lifestyle of the residents in the
21 surrounding area. And you tell me that all these
22 things are properly taken care of, I have no
23 problem. Thank you.

24 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
25 Dr. Sanghvi. Okay. Andy, you want to address the

1 question of Dr. Sanghvi's?

2 MR. WOZNIAK: Yeah, they are all taken
3 care of. Again, this is the state of the art
4 lighting system. They're not going on the cheap
5 and they're not putting in something that's
6 substandard, and I do believe that it will not
7 greatly impact the neighbors and it will -- it
8 will provide safety to the players and the fans.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Andy,
10 I saw there is one more slide. There's trees or
11 something, the bushes. Can you address those
12 questions and concerns about that? I'm not
13 understanding it properly on that. What do you
14 want to do with the trees? The neighbors
15 mentioned that issue.

16 MR. WOZNIAK: I'm not quite sure. This
17 parcel right here that I'm tracing is a five-acre
18 that CC's owned for the last decade, and that is
19 part of this development. Since we last visited
20 you, it has been cleared and earth moving has been
21 completed on this site. This was part of our last
22 submittal, and adjacent to that is the City of
23 Novi ten-acre park which remains.

24 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
25 you. Any other board member, please?

1 MEMBER MONTAGUE: While you've got the
2 photometrics up there, the blue line that you're
3 showing around you got red, green, blue, what's
4 the foot candles at that blue line?

5 MR. WOZNIAK: This is at a small scale.

6 MEMBER KRIEGER: It goes halfway into
7 the park.

8 MR. WOZNIAK: I don't know what it is,
9 but I can tell you that the numbers, which are
10 hard to see on this, which go actually -- they
11 actually give you the foot candle. They are all
12 zero at the property line because I've seen that
13 before and that was the first thing I looked for
14 when I received this, but I don't know what that
15 blue line is.

16 MEMBER MONTAGUE: There's no key that
17 shows us what the green.

18 MR. WOZNIAK: That could be the limits
19 of measurement. I'm just guessing. I don't know.

20 MR. BARBER: Typically, I can't speak
21 to it without pulling up the large scale, but
22 typically the final line is a point one foot
23 candle.

24 MS. FLETCHER: It does say point one on
25 the plans. If you zoom in on the PDF it does say

1 point one.

2 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Point one.

3 MS. FLETCHER: Yep. It's point one
4 blue line.

5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Any other
6 board member, please? Okay. Mr. Tompson.

7 MEMBER THOMPSON: I understand your
8 concerns. Like when you go to a popup event like
9 a concert and they're trying to put additional
10 lighting in the parking lot and it's 25 or 40 feet
11 high, a lot of those like the bigger disks that
12 shine the light down, we've had -- I've spent the
13 last three years at Novi High School on a Friday
14 night, we've had sons that play football for them
15 and cross, so we're out there quite a bit. And
16 the difference with going up the extra is pretty
17 much exactly what they said, that the light is
18 shining down on the spot they're trying to light
19 rather than just like the general area. So if
20 this is the same fixture that's in Novi High
21 School, I understand your concerns, but I would
22 approve what they want to do because I think it's
23 good for everyone.

24 MEMBER MCLEOD: So two things. One, I
25 did just do a quick Google search of the average

1 light size for a high school so that's confirmed,
2 at least as far as Google goes. But as a resident
3 who lives far too close to Novi High School, the
4 ambient light, you can see it over the horizon. I
5 do have a fair bit of trees and brush in the way,
6 so I don't get anything directly on my house, so
7 if that wasn't there, I don't know what the impact
8 would be. But to say that there's no ambient
9 light visible from the outside, I don't think you
10 can say that. At the same time, one thing I do
11 like about Novi High School is they developed
12 noise ordinances. So when they have a football
13 game, I'm definitely aware. 10:00 that quiets
14 down. Everyone goes home. It's nice and peaceful
15 and what it should be. If we were to move forward
16 with this, can we align the light timing to follow
17 the same ordinance as the noise timing, for
18 example, so at 10:00 the lights go out when the
19 noise goes out, that way, the neighbors could have
20 guaranteed peace, the 15% you said you would go
21 down to or if you would set it to zero at the end
22 of the day, or at the end of the event?

23 MR. WOZNIAK: Excuse me. Is there an
24 ordinance on noise?

25 MS. SAARELA: There is a noise

1 ordinance.

2 MR. HALL: We have a noise ordinance,
3 but the lighting ordinance does not have a cutoff
4 time on the lighting.

5 MR. WOZNIAK: So there is a noise
6 ordinance.

7 MR. HALL: There is a noise ordinance.
8 There's no cutoff time on lighting.

9 MR. WOZNIAK: I will say this, that
10 without a PA system you're not going have the
11 sporting event going, so I think it's a safe bet
12 that the lights are going off when the sound goes
13 off.

14 MR. TUREK: We're going to turn the
15 lights off as soon as we can because we're paying
16 for the power. Again, if we left them on one
17 time, I apologize. Again, it was not intentional.
18 We would never intentionally do that. As soon as
19 the stadium is cleared and people are safe, we
20 will turn the lights off as soon as we can. It's
21 just costing us money leaving them on.

22 MR. WOZNIAK: And those lights are 20
23 years old.

24 MR. TUREK: Those lights are expensive,
25 yeah.

1 MEMBER KRIEGER: So you said you're
2 going to build a berm?

3 MR. TUREK: It's already there.

4 MEMBER KRIEGER: It's already there.

5 MR. TUREK: It's along the south
6 property line. It raises up from her property.
7 It raises up about six, eight feet.

8 MEMBER KRIEGER: You have some pine
9 trees or something there or arborvitaes?

10 MR. WOZNIAK: I'd say there's over 40
11 trees being planted directly adjacent to her
12 property just north of the property.

13 MEMBER KRIEGER: And then for
14 maintenance when you have the wind blowing on the
15 poles or the light, how do you explain, the visors
16 that change the direction of the light down, that
17 those would be -- well, I noticed a big difference
18 myself over the years from the high school, the
19 lights would be glaring into the west side of
20 Taft, and now it's completely different. It seems
21 to be a good thing. And then 80 feet versus 50
22 feet. And, like you said, the sun going down,
23 it's physics and math, and having the awning on
24 the light to change it. If you're at a high
25 school, you know you're going to have a football

1 game, you know you need light. You know you need
2 safety. There's going to be sound. There's going
3 to be a band. I live between Northville and Novi
4 High School and Friday nights there's light and
5 sound and people going, coming, going. So it's an
6 expected, so you're maintaining and doing the most
7 that you can to minimize the light intrusion to
8 residential areas and you need light for safety
9 for the players.

10 And so because of the surrounding
11 Northville/Novi schools, it just makes sense that
12 for Catholic Central that they also would have the
13 ability to have a safe and good event for kids in
14 high school. And also the residential area,
15 they're aware that this is it and that the school
16 is doing the best they can. And as long as it's
17 maintained and the light goes off when the game is
18 over and the people have left and the sound is
19 back to calm weekend, then so be it. I approve
20 your request.

21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
22 Linda.

23 MS. SAARELA: I just want to let
24 everybody know that the noise ordinance is
25 operating play or permitting the playing of any

1 radio, television, electronic audio equipment,
2 musical and similar device in a residential area
3 such that a noise disturbance is created across a
4 real property boundary in a residential zoning
5 district between the hours of 10 p.m. and 7 a.m.

6 So the noise cut off is 10 p.m.

7 MR. TUREK: That's fine.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
9 Any other board member before going to a motion,
10 please? Looks like none. Dr. Sanghvi? Please go
11 ahead.

12 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. I think
13 comparing Novi High School and the Catholic High
14 School are comparing apples and oranges. They are
15 totally different locations, different terrain,
16 different kind of neighborhoods, different
17 residential areas. So even though the lighting
18 may be comparable, but otherwise, other
19 circumstances are very different. Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
21 Dr. Sanghvi. Any other board member before I call
22 for the motion? Okay. Looks like none. Michael
23 Thompson, can you make a motion, please?

24 MEMBER THOMPSON: I can. I move that
25 we grant the variance in case PZ24-0052 sought by

1 Catholic Central High School for the variance for
2 the stream light pole because the petitioner has
3 shown practical difficulty requiring getting the
4 permit. Without the variance the petitioner would
5 be unreasonably prevented or limited with respect
6 to use of the property because of the site
7 location and where the wetlands are on the site.
8 The property is unique because there are wetlands
9 in places where the poles would need to be
10 planted. The petitioner did not create the
11 condition as it has limited space for these poles.
12 The relief granted would not unreasonably
13 interfere with adjacent or surrounding property as
14 everything is planted on its own campus, and the
15 relief is consistent with the spirit and the
16 intent of the ordinance being that this site is a
17 one of a kind.

18 MEMBER KRIEGER: Second.

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

20 Roll call, please.

21 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

22 MEMBER MCLEOD: Yes.

23 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

24 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

25 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

1 MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

2 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

3 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

4 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

5 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

6 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

7 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

8 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

10 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion
11 carries.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA:

13 Congratulations. I want to mention ten seconds,
14 anyone who wants to speak on the case. Whoever
15 wants to present the case has to be present all
16 the time. Then the audience time is three minutes
17 of time because we have a lot of cases. Thank you
18 so much. Case number PZ24-0055 (Central Park
19 Estates South) north of Eleven Mile Road, east of
20 Beck Road, Parcel 50-22-16-300-055. The applicant
21 is requesting variances from the City of Novi
22 Zoning Ordinance Section 3.8.2.C for an increase
23 in maximum horizontal length of the building to
24 261 ft. (180 ft. Maximum, variance of 81 ft.);
25 Section 3.8.2.F for a reduction in parking setback

1 to 11.5 ft. (Per Section 3.1.8.D, 20 ft. Required,
2 variance of 8.5 ft.); Section 5.10.1.B.vi for a
3 reduction of building setback from the abutting
4 parking spaces to 17 ft. (25 ft. Required,
5 variance of 8 ft.); and Section 3.1.8.D to either
6 allow areas with less than 50-foot dimension to be
7 considered as usable open space or reduce the
8 required open space to 19,726 sq. Ft. (28,400 sq.
9 Ft. Required, variance of 8,674 sq. Ft.) This
10 property is zoned High-Density Multiple-Family
11 (RM-2). Is the applicant present? Please go
12 ahead.

13 MEMBER LONGO: State your name and
14 spell it for us, please.

15 MR. BOWMAN: Sure. Blair, B-L-A-I-R,
16 Bowman, B-O-W-M-A-N.

17 MEMBER LONGO: Are you an attorney.

18 MR. BOWMAN: I'm not practicing, no P
19 number.

20 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell
21 the truth in this case?

22 MR. BOWMAN: Yes.

23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
24 Mr. Blair. Please go ahead and present your case
25 where we can help you tonight on this.

1 MR. BOWMAN: So we were here basically
2 a year ago and we received the variances as
3 requested and did receive preliminary site plan
4 approval unanimously also from the planning
5 commission. As a part of that approval, we were
6 required to gain a EGLE wetland permit including
7 some mitigation work that was going to go on on
8 the site verses in an offsite or bank situation.
9 That process frankly took us a considerable amount
10 of time, much longer than we anticipated. We did
11 not receive the formal permit, which we were
12 cautioned that we needed that before we took any
13 further activity. We could have technically come
14 in for final site plan, but without knowing that
15 we actually had the formal permit in the hand,
16 that could have been at great jeopardy. So we did
17 not get that permit until the first week in
18 September, almost a year since we applied for it.

19 So I'm here requesting I think
20 technically an extension or another one-year grant
21 to the variances so we can now follow through with
22 the process with that permit in hand.

23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
24 Mr. Blair. Okay. From the city.

25 MR. HALL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

1 Yes. The applicant is seeking four variances
2 tonight, and all four of these variances were
3 approved on November 24, 2023. Just to briefly go
4 over these variances one more time. He's asking
5 for an 81 foot variance to increase the maximum
6 horizontal length of the building. That would be
7 one grant. The second grant would be an eight and
8 a half foot variance to reduce the parking setback
9 between the parking and the property line. Number
10 three would be an eight foot variance to reduce
11 the parking setback between the parking and the
12 building. And number four is to a reduction of
13 open space, which the applicant seeking request
14 variance for 8,674 square feet. That's correct.
15 Is that correct?

16 MR. BOWMAN: Technically, yes. But all
17 of it was done, I might add, for positioning the
18 building and configuring the building to stay out
19 of the sensitive areas, and it's a part and parcel
20 of a long-term plan dual project along existing
21 Central Park Estates, and some of those are really
22 more technical setbacks, and certainly the open
23 space is the greatest example of it. It's a part
24 of a large park complex and trails and other open
25 spaces as well.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
2 you so much, Mr. Blair. Correspondence secretary?

3 MEMBER LONGO: We mailed out 15
4 mailings and eight were returned. There were no
5 objections and no approvals.

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you so
7 much. Public, any comments? From the public, any
8 comments? Looks like none. It's time for the
9 board, and I have no objection because it's
10 already approved on those things and all the four
11 variance and I open to the board. Dr. Sanghvi.

12 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. Good
13 evening, Mr. Bowman. I've known this complex many
14 years. But I did go out there and drove around
15 everywhere. I'd just like you to show me on the
16 map to the people's homes where are you making
17 these changes.

18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
19 Dr. Sanghvi for the question.

20 MR. BOWMAN: So, Dr. Sanghvi, your
21 exact question was where is the project and what
22 we're looking to do?

23 MEMBER SANGHVI: Just show me where
24 exactly this is going to be.

25 MR. BOWMAN: So this is the existing

1 Central Park project is surrounding it. So to
2 give you a point of reference, this is the tennis
3 courts and the clubhouse for the existing Central
4 Park would be here. So this is to the south.
5 Directly basically across from the road is a
6 senior living center, so we will have basically a
7 joined intersection there. And the podium style
8 building will be then to the south of the existing
9 clubhouse. And then the woodlands and the newly
10 created wetlands will be off to the side of that.

11 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you so
13 much, Mr. Blair. Any other board member? Looks
14 like none. Motion time. Mr. Clift Montague.

15 MEMBER MONTAGUE: I move that we grant
16 the variance in case number PZ24-0055 sought by
17 Central Park Estates for an 81 foot variance to
18 increase the maximum horizontal length of the
19 building, an 8.5 foot variance to reduce the
20 parking setback between the parking property line,
21 an eight foot variance to reduce the parking
22 setback between the parking and the building, and
23 a reduction in open space of 8,674 square feet.
24 Without the variance, the petitioner will be
25 unreasonably prevented with respect to the

1 property use because it's a unique property with
2 wetland preservation requirements. The property
3 is unique because of its configuration, the
4 location and environmental features. Petitioner
5 did not create the condition because the site
6 conditions were obviously existing. The relief
7 granted will not unreasonably interfere with the
8 adjacent properties because it's consistent with
9 the surrounding uses. As a matter of fact, it's
10 part of a continuing development. So relief is
11 consistent with the spirit and intent of the
12 ordinance because it allows quality development in
13 Novi. And just note that the variances were
14 previously approved.

15 MEMBER KRIEGER: Second.

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

17 Roll call, please.

18 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

19 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

20 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

21 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

22 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

23 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

24 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

25 MEMBER MCLEOD: Yes.

1 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

2 MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

3 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

4 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

5 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

7 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion

8 carries.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA:

10 Congratulations. PZ24-0056 (Lina Wang & Brandon
11 Ellis) 43145 Thirteen Mile Road, on Thirteen Mile
12 Road, east of South Lake Drive, Parcel
13 50-22-11-101-014. The applicant is requesting a
14 variance from the City of Novi Zoning Ordinance
15 Section 4.19.B to allow an accessory structure in
16 the exterior side yard. This property is zoned
17 One-Family Residential (R-4). Okay. Please go
18 ahead and present your case, Mr. --

19 MR. ELLIS: My name is Brandon Ellis,
20 that's B-R-A-N-D-O-N, E-L-L-I-S. I am not an
21 attorney.

22 MEMBER LONGO: Brandon, do you promise
23 to tell the truth in this case?

24 MR. ELLIS: I do.

25 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please go
2 ahead where we can help you tonight on this.

3 MR. ELLIS: First thing I just want to
4 note real quick on this public hearing notice, I
5 didn't know I could say this before, but under
6 applicant it says Catholic Central on mine.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

8 MR. ELLIS: So it must be a mistake.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: There's a
10 mistake okay. We excuse that. Thank you. Please
11 go ahead. Sorry for that.

12 MR. ELLIS: So this is just a diagram
13 of our house. We purchased the house new in 2023
14 and moved in. It's a corner lot. It's on the
15 corner of 13 Mile Road and Martin Avenue. Martin
16 Avenue, it's a local Residential Street.

17 So what we'd like to do is we'd like to
18 put in an accessory shed for lawn equipment, that
19 type of stuff. And based on the existing
20 setbacks, our lot because we're on a corner site,
21 we're considered as having two front yards. And
22 as a result, more, slightly more than half of our
23 entire lot is within a front setback. And because
24 of that, there's legitimately there's no place
25 that we could put a shed on the property. So what

1 we're asking for is to be able to put this shed on
2 the side facing Martin Street, and to stay
3 consistent with a side yard setback of six feet to
4 put in that shed.

5 This is an exhibit, just a photo
6 showing taken from our driveway facing south.
7 This is the exact area where the shed would be
8 located. This here is another view. This is
9 facing east towards Martin Street and the shed
10 would be on the north left side of this page.
11 This here are some diagrams showing the
12 construction of the shed. It has a sidewall
13 height of seven feet and a total height of a
14 little over 11 feet to the top of the eaves. They
15 would have a double door on the one side. So I
16 have a riding mower that I could put into the shed
17 that way. The shed is a Michigan made product.
18 It's an Amish shed made over in the Muskegon area.
19 And this is what the shed, what it looks like.
20 And it would be finished in a color scheme that is
21 consistent with our home. And we believe it's an
22 attractive feature and it would provide some, I
23 don't know shading, but a little bit of privacy
24 from view from our deck to the road. So that's
25 the story here.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.
2 Brandon, that's a good presentation. You brought
3 all the papers. Anybody would like to speak on
4 this case or are you the only person?

5 MR. ELLIS: I'm the only person. My
6 wife's home with the kids.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
8 you. And from the city.

9 MR. HALL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
10 Yes, he is seeking for a variance to be what's
11 called the exterior side yard, which would be the
12 front yard off of Martin Road. Just by looking at
13 this picture here, what is the floor material
14 you're going to use?

15 MR. ELLIS: The floor material is a
16 sanded plywood, but there is a concrete base below
17 that.

18 MR. HALL: Is there going to be
19 foundations in that concrete base or how are you
20 going to anchor this? What's your plans here?

21 MR. ELLIS: You may be surprised. I
22 was surprised to learn that these storage sheds
23 aren't actually anchored down. The weight of them
24 keeps them in place. So that's what we learned
25 when we went there and asked about that. I was

1 considering putting in some bolts myself, but they
2 told me it's not necessary.

3 MR. HALL: Are you going to have any
4 electrical to this, any lights or any kind of
5 electrical provisions for the shed?

6 MR. ELLIS: No. There's no electrical.

7 MR. HALL: Could you put the first
8 photograph that you showed of the yard? So your
9 first graphic that you showed the layout of the
10 shed, it will start at the corner of the house.
11 If you see that picture there you can see the
12 corner. You see the condenser for the air
13 conditioning unit and then the house. That's
14 where the front of the shed would be, it would
15 carry on back. There's quite a big depression
16 there that's in your grade in the back. You see
17 that little hole there?

18 MR. ELLIS: Yes.

19 MR. HALL: I believe that's by design.
20 I think that there's an engineering aspect for the
21 water in that area. So you indicate a manhole
22 that's in the right-of-way, and you show the --
23 your property line on your drawing. That property
24 line is the edge of the right-of-way. So you
25 can't do anything in the right-of-way, which

1 you're not suggesting, I'm just showing you where
2 the right-of-way would be from our avenue and
3 there's an easement for storm water. But there is
4 a lot of drainage there. You have a sump area in
5 your basement I think that's pumping water to I
6 believe the water manhole, is that correct?

7 MR. ELLIS: It comes out that side, so
8 I believe so.

9 MR. HALL: Is there a pipe that goes
10 from the sump pump or does it just go on the
11 ground over?

12 MR. ELLIS: It comes out the side of
13 the house and then goes down.

14 MR. HALL: Is there a pipe that goes
15 from your house all the way to the manhole or do
16 you see the water come out of your house? Do you
17 actually see the water exit your house?

18 MR. ELLIS: I know what pipe it is. I
19 don't see where it is exiting into that storm
20 drain.

21 MR. HALL: So I'm only highlighting
22 these because the grade is quite significant
23 there. There is an engineering aspect because
24 there's a lot of water coming at your rear yard
25 from your neighboring houses going down that swale

1 all the way down there to that depression. By
2 setting the shed in that area, there's going to be
3 a civil component of drainage we have to work on.
4 So there's no other sheds down the street on
5 either side in this exterior side yard that's
6 there. But if the board would approve this
7 tonight, we would ask in the motion that it has to
8 have improvement plan associated with that so we
9 can look at the design aspects and make sure that
10 the engineering can be satisfied.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

12 MR. HALL: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Appreciate
14 it. Okay. Correspondence?

15 MEMBER LONGO: So we mailed out 29
16 letters. None were returned. There were no
17 objections or approvals officially, but you did
18 receive five letters from neighbors that did
19 approve your plan.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
21 Any other public would like to speak on this case,
22 please? Okay. Looks like none. As the city
23 mentioned, Brandon, you need to keep in
24 consideration what is the slope is there, and also
25 how it goes you need to think on that when setting

1 up the storage place. And also do you have any
2 association in this subdivision?

3 MR. ELLIS: No. It's just a single
4 family lot. It's not part of a condominium site
5 plan.

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Do you have
7 an aerial plan of this house?

8 MR. ELLIS: I don't. I would have to
9 bring it up on my phone. Would you like me to do
10 that?

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, please.
12 I want to see the aerial of the houses. Can you
13 show your house, where it is and your neighbors
14 and the road?

15 MR. ELLIS: This is my house right
16 here. This is 13 Mile. This is Martin Avenue.
17 And the proposed shed is in this location right
18 here.

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: The back of
20 your house, how many houses are there, do you
21 know? I'm not asking the water is coming from
22 their side to your side?

23 MR. ELLIS: Their sump pump exits back
24 by that fence, and then the water kind of goes
25 underground at the edge of that easement and makes

1 its way to that drain.

2 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: See, I have
3 no objection to the variance if water is blocking
4 or something, this should not be in the future for
5 you. Apart from that, I have no objection in this
6 case, and it's open to the board. Anybody would
7 like to speak on this case, the board members?
8 Linda?

9 MEMBER KRIEGER: Did you take into
10 consideration the one that you're going to have
11 the shed placed there but that there's somebody is
12 going to landscape it for you so they can handle
13 the slope?

14 MR. ELLIS: It's -- I had thought about
15 putting just some potted plants around the
16 exterior.

17 MEMBER KRIEGER: Well, I mean when you
18 put in your cement pad and they put it on top that
19 it's going to change, you can either build up and
20 then have your cement pad or pull it out so that
21 it's all level?

22 MR. ELLIS: The idea was to build it up
23 so that way I would be able to -- the double
24 doors, they would be facing the driveway here. So
25 it would be built up at the back end so that you

1 could drive in level from the driveway side.

2 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. And then so the
3 double doors you'll have them facing your driveway
4 so that you can see them. And then with the slope
5 and then the hundred year flood issues that the
6 water ends up going there, if you get like really
7 bad spring rain then it could raise up. So that's
8 what they're talking about when they ask you for
9 the land improvement plan.

10 MR. ELLIS: Okay.

11 MEMBER KRIEGER: Have you put that in
12 your planning?

13 MR. ELLIS: A land improvement plan?
14 No. I don't -- didn't know that I needed to do
15 that.

16 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. And then for
17 storage, you're just going to have the tractor in
18 there or paint or oils or anything because you
19 don't want that going into the storm water either.

20 MR. ELLIS: It's just for like lawn
21 equipment like shovels and things that are in the
22 garage. And then I mean I can keep the gas in the
23 garage just as easily. It's just somewhere where
24 I could move the tractor so I could have more room
25 for the car in the garage.

1 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yeah. Makes sense.
2 That's understandable. Because you have two
3 fronts, I understand your having a need for the
4 variance to have it. So I'll listen to the other
5 members. Thank you.

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay, Linda.
7 Dr. Sanghvi.

8 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. Well, I
9 came there last week and drove around 13 Mile,
10 Martin, behind all around. Some of the questions
11 they've already been asked by Linda here. But my
12 main concern was you've got two front yards
13 technically because of the corner, and that makes
14 it easier and a little more difficult to put a
15 shed in the proper place. And so now that you
16 have explained, I have no further questions.
17 Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
19 Dr. Sanghvi. Any other board member, please? Go
20 ahead, Thompson.

21 MEMBER THOMPSON: So it looks like if
22 this is the house, then this is the street, the
23 yard is going to be going down this way, okay? So
24 at some point is the thought -- I think what Linda
25 was trying to get to for the earth improvement

1 deal, are you going to like dig into the earth to
2 get it flat or are you going to put dirt up?

3 MR. ELLIS: We're going to put dirt up.

4 MEMBER THOMPSON: So that's going to
5 leave a pretty fair, it's tough to tell exactly by
6 the picture, but that's going to leave a thing of
7 cement people are going to be looking at somewhere
8 in that area?

9 MR. ELLIS: Yes. It's going to be
10 built up. We had already approached a cement
11 contractor to get that work done. Just held off
12 on doing it at this point. And we had agreed this
13 would be the best way to do it, to build it up.

14 MEMBER THOMPSON: I've been on the
15 board for a couple years and I've never heard
16 about the earth improvement part. So I would be
17 for the shed. I would just like to know how the
18 slab was going to be positioned and stuff before
19 being able to approve it.

20 MR. HALL: Can I answer?

21 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yeah.

22 MR. HALL: So I think we can handle in
23 the land improvement stage with the engineers and
24 they can discuss that because it might not be a
25 sheer wall there, it might be land going up to it.

1 We just got to make sure that the two houses you
2 see on that aerial up there, his house and the one
3 to your left, which is on 13 Mile, that's where
4 the swale is coming across the backyard going that
5 way. Just got to make sure we don't stop the
6 water or flood the street or something like
7 changing the grades and doing something that would
8 change that pattern. There was a pattern and a
9 problem before, and they came in and the city
10 engineers did some work on that. That was part of
11 the solution. Now we're going to change, I just
12 want to make sure the land approval looks at that
13 change and looks at what the engineering has done
14 to make sure we don't do something to adversely
15 affect the other neighbors when this goes down.

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: I have a
17 question for the city. The land improvement, are
18 we doing this case today? Once this land
19 improvement is done, how do you want to move on
20 this case today?

21 MR. HALL: I think that the board can
22 approve the shed and the exterior side yard as a
23 concept, would you want that in the side yard and
24 the front yard, that part of the road. That would
25 be what's before us today. I would just put in

1 the motion for shed just as a note, the new shed
2 design, as the applicant suggested, foundations
3 may not be necessary, or they might be. But part
4 of the engineering for that would discuss that.
5 There's no mandate in our ordinance to require a
6 land improvement plan to put in the shed. But in
7 this case, because it is affecting a land
8 situation and may affect others or himself, we
9 would suggest that you put the caveat of having
10 that land approval plan provided so we can adjust
11 to have the engineering level.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
13 you. You understand, Mr. Brandon?

14 MR. ELLIS: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Any
16 other board member, please? Any comments? Okay.
17 Linda, can you make a motion, please.

18 MEMBER KRIEGER: In case number
19 PZ24-0056 for Lina Wang and Brandon Ellis for
20 43145 Thirteen Mile, I move to approve the request
21 of the applicant for the variance to allow an
22 accessory structure in the exterior side yard.
23 The applicant has two front yards because they
24 have two streets. The petitioner did not create
25 the difficulty. The house is planned that way.

1 Without the variance, the petitioner will be
2 unreasonably prevented or limited with respect to
3 use of the property because of his necessity for
4 assisted protection of his personal property. The
5 property is unique because of its location on two
6 fronts, so having a side yard is depending on
7 which street you're on. So Martin would be a
8 front. So the shed he said would be decorated to
9 match the house so it would be -- I can't think of
10 the word. The petitioner did not create the
11 condition because of the division of the way the
12 property is, they created a swale, and to take
13 care of the water issue as well. The relief
14 granted will not interfere unreasonably with
15 adjacent or surrounding properties because the
16 petitioner will have worked with the city for a
17 land improvement plan to take care of any concerns
18 for water easement or water or flooding because
19 the water drain and the swale to create a no
20 flooding in the streets or in basements. The
21 relief granted will not unreasonably interfere
22 with adjacent or surrounding properties because of
23 that. The relief is consistent with the spirit
24 and intent of the ordinance because of the work
25 with the city, and that's it.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: There's no
2 electricity mentioned.

3 MS. SAARELA: I would specifically say
4 conditioned on submittal of the land improvement.

5 MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

6 MEMBER KRIEGER: With the condition of
7 the land improvement plan with the city.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay, please.
9 And Dr. Sanghvi, you are second. Roll call,
10 please.

11 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

13 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

14 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

15 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

16 MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

17 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

18 MEMBER MCLEOD: Yes.

19 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

20 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

21 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

22 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

23 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

24 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

25 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion

1 passes.

2 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you
3 Brandon. And follow the city rules and
4 guidelines. Thank you. Case number five tonight,
5 PZ24-0057 (Michigan State University Federal
6 Credit Union) 43420 Grand River Avenue, on the
7 northwest corner of Grand River Avenue and Novi
8 Road, Parcel 50-22-15-476-055. The applicant is
9 requesting a variance from the City of Novi Sign
10 Ordinance Section 28-5(d) to allow 4 additional
11 wall signs on the north, south, east and west
12 elevation (Maximum of two wall signs are allowed
13 for this tenant, variance of 4 additional wall
14 signs). This property is zoned Town Center-1
15 (TC-1). Okay. Please go ahead and spell your
16 first and last name clearly. And also, if anybody
17 is speaking on your case, they also come to the
18 podium and you can continue. Thank you.

19 MR. PEARSON: Good evening, folks. My
20 name is Josh Pearson, J-O-S-H, P-E-A-R-S-O-N.

21 MEMBER LONGO: Josh, are you an
22 attorney?

23 MR. PEARSON: I am not.

24 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell
25 the truth in this case?

1 MR. PEARSON: Yes.

2 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please go
4 ahead, Josh, where we can help you tonight on this
5 case.

6 MR. PEARSON: I just want to quickly
7 introduce a few of my people here. We've got
8 Aaron Bodell.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please come
10 to the podium everybody wants to speak on this
11 case.

12 MR. PEARSON: I'm not sure if they're
13 going to speak.

14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Then you
15 don't have to introduce anybody.

16 MR. PEARSON: Okay.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

18 MR. PEARSON: Get right to the subject
19 here. We're looking for four additional signs on
20 this corner. The first one being the home loan
21 sign, which is a dual brand through the MSU
22 Federal Credit Union. This would satisfy their
23 home loans, mortgage company. And we're placing
24 it on this frontage because it is the largest
25 frontage of the building itself and it's along

1 Novi Road, which is obviously a pretty active
2 road.

3 The second signs that we are looking to
4 would be more located at the main entrance, which
5 is located -- sorry. There we go. So the main
6 entrance to this site is off of Novi Road over
7 here and then off Grand River as well over here.
8 Then once you enter into the site, it's hard for
9 any of the members and whatnot to find the
10 location of these signs or find the location of
11 the entrance to the building. In fact, they've
12 already reported that they've had members come
13 around to the front of the building already along
14 the corner and into the employee entrance along
15 the side there just trying to locate the main
16 entrance itself. So we believe adding these two
17 main entrance signs would satisfy that.

18 Based on the site plan, the one on this
19 side here, which I believe is our variance four
20 sign is located towards the ADA entrance and the
21 night drop deposit, which is used throughout the
22 day and evenings by members, and it also helps
23 satisfy the Novi entrance, so people coming into
24 that end of the parking lot would understand where
25 they're entering at.

1 necessary, not only just for general
2 advertisement, but as well as way finding safety.
3 You know, obviously I think you guys know this
4 corner is a pretty busy area for people to find
5 the location to be able to come in and enter into
6 the site. So those are the four signs.

7 One other item to note, we do not have
8 any ground signs located around here at all. It's
9 pretty tough for the offsets to get them in in any
10 of those two areas, so we decided that this was
11 the better approach. And we also understand that
12 this building was originally designed to hold at
13 least two other tenants. The credit union is
14 currently occupying the entire building and using
15 the home loans as sort of a subsidiary of their
16 main branch, which is a part of their associated
17 brand.

18 So really, we believe that it helps us
19 with circulation and safety for the general way
20 finding of the site, both vehicle and pedestrian.

21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
22 Josh. From the city.

23 MR. HALL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
24 Yes. He's seeking four variances for the signs
25 that he's putting up on this presentation. On

1 these signs, they are internally lit, is that
2 correct, all four signs?

3 MR. PEARSON: Correct.

4 MR. HALL: There's no animations or any
5 kind of lights that would be unusual?

6 MR. PEARSON: That is correct.

7 MR. HALL: We agree these are needed
8 for the way finding of the site. The site is
9 tight. It's kind of uniquely shaped in where it
10 is, so we have no comments. Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
12 city. Any public hearing on this case, please?
13 Okay. Looks like none. Okay. Josh, thank you
14 for business in Novi City. We really appreciate
15 for that. The site is very hard and it's very
16 difficult traffic going around. I have no
17 objection on these things. And where is this kind
18 of sign lighting just regular? How are these lit?

19 MR. PEARSON: They are lit signs.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Is it
21 blinking?

22 MR. PEARSON: No, they're not blinking.
23 They're just a light.

24 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Do you have
25 any timing on those lights?

1 MR. PEARSON: Yes, there is. I don't
2 know what the timing is, but I can get that
3 information if needed.

4 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: What are the
5 working hours?

6 MR. PEARSON: During working hours I
7 believe are 9 a.m. to 5 p.m.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. Make
9 sure no blinking or LED or anything in terms of
10 traffic going and distraction and those things.
11 Okay. Thank you. And it's open to the board.
12 Okay. Dr. Sanghvi.

13 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. Do we have
14 any dimensions for these signs?

15 MR. PEARSON: We do. The initial
16 package I can give you those dimensions right now.
17 The home loans is currently 50 square feet, six
18 feet by eight feet. Six foot by eight foot four.
19 The signs that are located at the entrance along
20 the back parking lot are seven feet three quarter
21 by two foot one, and it's 15.25 square feet. And
22 then one along Grand River MSU FCU Federal Credit
23 Union sign is 31.5 square feet, and it's ten foot
24 six by three foot.

25 MEMBER KRIEGER: So they're all within

1 city ordinance.

2 MR. PEARSON: They are all within city
3 ordinance. And in the photograph there, they
4 actually match the two that you see on there. The
5 one in the corner is the same one that goes at the
6 entrance, and the one on Novi Road is the one that
7 goes along Grand River.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Josh, are you
9 a contractor or a banker?

10 MR. PEARSON: I'm the project manager.

11 MEMBER SANGHVI: I'd just like you to
12 show me on your diagram or photograph which is the
13 main entrance from the parking lot.

14 MR. PEARSON: So there are two. We
15 have an ADA main entrance and then a standard
16 entrance, and they both face each one of the two
17 parking lots. So this entrance right here is
18 where our ATM is located. This is a standard
19 pedestrian entrance, and then our ADA entrance is
20 on this facade here. Right here's the entrance
21 and then our night drop bank is right here, that
22 vault.

23 MEMBER SANGHVI: I came and drove
24 around here and went in your parking lot, walked
25 around to see, and all these different signs you

1 are suggesting, I can understand four signs on the
2 four different walls, but you need additional sign
3 to tell them where is the main entrance.

4 MR. PEARSON: Correct.

5 MEMBER SANGHVI: Apart from telling
6 them what are your services on your sign also.

7 MR. PEARSON: Correct.

8 MEMBER SANGHVI: Considering the
9 location and the topography of the area and the
10 busy traffic and everything, I can understand your
11 need for more signs than usual and I have no
12 problem supporting your application. Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
14 Dr. Sanghvi.

15 MEMBER LONGO: I'd like to add that we
16 mailed out 28 notices, one was returned. There
17 were no objections and no approvals.

18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Sorry
19 secretary correspondence. Thank you so much.
20 Okay. Any other board member, please? Okay.
21 Jay.

22 MEMBER MCLEOD: In looking over the
23 site, the only sign that I really see is
24 superfluous in this case is the one on Grand
25 River. People would not turn left into your

1 building upon seeing this sign. I don't think
2 they can based on the way the driveway is set up.
3 Anyone heading west on Grand River will be able to
4 see the central sign, the one in the center that
5 you already have.

6 MR. PEARSON: Correct.

7 MEMBER MCLEOD: So I mean six signs
8 does sound excessive. Trying to find a way to
9 cull back where we can is the one that doesn't
10 seem like it contributes anything other than I'll
11 call it a branding or image at that point. I do
12 think the corner sign does serve the purpose.
13 It's catching people turning left on Novi as well
14 as people heading west down Grand River. The
15 others, especially when you have to find the door,
16 it is annoying when customers try going to the
17 front of the building. Although I think there's
18 many pedestrians that are going to have their eyes
19 caught in that area. There's not too many people
20 walking around. But that's the one sign I would
21 not want to approve.

22 MR. PEARSON: So you're discussing the
23 Grand River one. I agree with everything you're
24 saying. When you're coming west on Grand River
25 you're right, you would see that one that sits way

1 at the corner up there. You're correct. However,
2 you're running east at all, you have no idea
3 you've even passed it. You can go right through
4 that intersection and realize you even passed it
5 and you'd have to find a way to turn back around
6 and come back down the other way. You cannot see
7 any signage coming up going east on Grand River.
8 I know you can't turn into that, I get it, but at
9 least then you know it's there and not miss that
10 turn onto Novi Road which then leads you up to the
11 second entrance.

12 MEMBER MCLEOD: The other thing I want
13 to call out. We do live in a day where everyone
14 uses their cell phone to find locations. The need
15 for a substantial amount of signs to find your way
16 through doesn't really exist today. I don't like
17 the idea of using 1960s problems to solve 2025
18 issues. I don't think that that sign is
19 necessary.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
21 Jay.

22 MEMBER LONGO: I'd like to disagree
23 with Jay. That is such a busy intersection and
24 you don't want people missing it. I'm a senior,
25 so you don't want me looking all over the place

1 trying to figure out where to get in the parking
2 lot. Getting into the door is important, I agree
3 with that. But I don't think it's excessive the
4 number of signs. I think you need those signs for
5 that. It's a crazy intersection. It's just
6 crazy. Those are my words.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you so
8 much.

9 MEMBER MONTAGUE: I guess I would add
10 to that, as you're coming up Novi Road going north
11 there, you see the building and you've got to turn
12 left and that will get you to that entrance, so
13 you're not hesitating trying to figure out, or
14 going up on Novi Road, I wouldn't go Novi Road
15 because then you got to turn left into there. I'd
16 turn left on Grand River and go in there. So I
17 think it does help with the safety and the
18 directional to have that sign there, to be quite
19 honest. I came up there and looked today. It's a
20 very odd building to be one tenant because it's
21 all segmented. So I think I would agree. I think
22 there is a purpose to that from a way finding
23 safety point of view.

24 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
25 you. Any other board member, please. Okay. Time

1 for the motion Dr. Sanghvi.

2 MR. HALL: Can I have a point of
3 clarification?

4 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Sure.

5 MR. HALL: You mentioned that the
6 lighting is backlit on the signs?

7 MR. PEARSON: Correct.

8 MR. HALL: So is that a halo type
9 lighting?

10 MR. PEARSON: They're internally LED.

11 MR. HALL: My only warning would be is
12 if they did spill out like a halo lighting, it
13 would have to be a white light. It can't be a
14 color light.

15 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Any other
16 inquest before motion? Okay. Dr. Sanghvi.

17 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. I move
18 that we grant the variance in the case number
19 PZ24-0057 sought by the Michigan State University
20 Federal Credit Union located at 43420 Grand River
21 Avenue on the northwest corner of Grand River
22 Avenue and Novi Road, parcel number
23 50-22-15-476-055. The applicant has demonstrated
24 sufficient hardship to need for these variances
25 because of the primary location of this business,

1 and also the location of the parking lot and
2 making to facilitate the arrival and departure of
3 the customers coming into this building easier is
4 number of signs are requested and needed. The
5 failure to grant relief will simply make it
6 difficult for the customers as well as the
7 business to do its regular function. The granting
8 of relief has already been offset by the way they
9 have constructed the building and the signs that
10 were erected and the dimensions of the signs that
11 we already mentioned in the application. The kind
12 of relief will not result in difficulty and
13 incompatible or interfere with the adjacent
14 surroundings of this busy intersection. And this
15 is in the spirit of the ordinance, these
16 variances, and there doesn't need any other kind
17 of conditions about erecting these signs. Thank
18 you.

19 MEMBER KRIEGER: Second.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

21 Roll call, please.

22 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

23 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

24 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

25 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

1 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?
2 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.
3 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?
4 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.
5 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?
6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.
7 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod.
8 MEMBER MCLEOD: No.
9 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?
10 MEMBER LONGO: Yes.
11 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion
12 carries.
13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Good luck.
14 Congratulations. Okay. I know the last case is
15 waiting. Let these gentlemen all go and we can
16 start the case. Today's final case. PZ24-0058
17 (Josh & Erin Robinson) 1375 East Lake Drive, on
18 East Lake Drive, north of Thirteen Mile Road,
19 Parcel 50-22-02-328-009. The applicant is
20 requesting variances from the City of Novi Zoning
21 Ordinance Section 3.32(10)A.ii.a for a 330 sq. Ft.
22 Shed (100 sq. Ft. Allowed, variance of 230 sq.
23 Ft.); Section 3.32(10)A.ii.a to allow 10.75 ft.
24 Shed height (9 ft. Allowed, variance of 1.75 sq.
25 Ft.); Section 3.32(10)A.ii.b to allow 8.57% lot

1 coverage (5% allowed, variance of 3.57%). This
2 property is zoned One-Family Residential (R-4).
3 Okay. Please go ahead and spell your first and
4 last name clearly. If you're presenting both of
5 you, spell your both names. If you're not an
6 attorney, please take the oath from the secretary.
7 Thank you.

8 MR. ROBINSON: Josh Robinson, J-O-S-H,
9 R-O-B-I-N-S-O-N.

10 MS. ROBINSON: Erin Robinson, E-R-I-N
11 R-O-B-I-N-S-O-N.

12 MR. ROBINSON: We are not attorneys.

13 MEMBER LONGO: Neither one of you are
14 attorneys. Do you both promise to tell the truth
15 in this case?

16 MR. ROBINSON: Yes.

17 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

18 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay, Mr.
20 Josh and Erin, please go ahead where we can help
21 you tonight on this case.

22 MR. ROBINSON: So we came before you a
23 few months back about a variance on a shed, which
24 at that point you did approve, so we thank you for
25 that. However, as we worked through some of the

1 details we came to understand or came upon a bit
2 of concern for one of the aspects of that, and
3 that was about merging our two lots. So we own
4 the lot next door to our primary property, and
5 where the concern of that is is really that based
6 on the size of that lot that once we merge it we
7 can no longer split those again. So while we have
8 no intention of ever selling that lot, we love the
9 lot, just if there are any financial hardships in
10 the future, anything that comes to that point that
11 if we can't sell that and end up having to sell
12 our entire property, that could obviously create
13 some concern or some downfall to that.

14 MS. ROBINSON: When you approved it
15 last time, which again, we're very grateful for,
16 there were some contingencies, and one was that we
17 had to join the lots on the lakeside. And at the
18 time, we agreed. We were very happy and said
19 sure, we'll do that. And then we learned that
20 basically if we do that, we can never ever ever
21 split them. So if it ever comes to needing to
22 sell one of our two properties, we have to sell
23 both of them. We are small business owners.
24 Thank God we're very fortunate, like we're very
25 very fortunate to afford both properties and have

1 a beautiful home and the house next door that we
2 just demoed actually. But if a financial hardship
3 fell upon us or anything happened, we would like
4 the flexibility to be able to sell one of the two
5 properties without having to sell the whole and
6 selling our entire home over a shed. Like we're
7 not willing to do the shed over, you know, this
8 financial potential risk in the future.

9 MR. ROBINSON: Our hardship does stand.
10 We actually purchased the property after we
11 initially came to you guys in the first place. So
12 whether we had that or not, our hardship still
13 would remain. So we'd love for it to be looked at
14 as a single property, knowing the secondary
15 property the plan is to always keep. Like Erin
16 said, we just tore down the house next door.
17 We're investing into landscaping to make this all
18 one.

19 MS. ROBINSON: We want to make all of
20 it look beautiful.

21 MR. ROBINSON: So we're hoping for a
22 little bit of flexibility within that one aspect.
23 We obviously understand where you're coming from,
24 but in theory, none of the circumstances would
25 change, or at least we hope.

1 MS. ROBINSON: We just have to be smart
2 about it and doing the loss does not work in our
3 favor if financial hardship falls upon us.

4 MR. ROBINSON: Which we don't expect.

5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Josh
6 do you have any pictures where you can present on
7 the presenter, please?

8 MS. ROBINSON: Are you looking for the
9 property or the shed?

10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Both.

11 MR. ROBINSON: Very simplistic plan.
12 20-by-16 1/2 is the size of the shed. And
13 essentially this is really built the idea of this
14 is for safety. When we brought this to you
15 before, we talked about some of the challenges of
16 living on East Lake Drive, and a few of you
17 understood those circumstances. It's unfortunate
18 while we love the street, we love the area,
19 there's a lot of heavy traffic that comes through
20 and very irresponsible drivers that go along with
21 that. So yeah. That's where the need of this
22 really comes in to storing things so we don't have
23 to walk them across the street. So here is the
24 view. So we do, again, we have the property which
25 comes over another I think roughly 60 feet. So

1 this is our single property. But the additional
2 property is roughly another 60 feet wide.

3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Any other
4 things you'd like to add, Josh?

5 MR. ROBINSON: The only other thing is
6 if in some situation, again knock on wood, that we
7 never have to sell that property, if we were to,
8 really, the only person impacted by this would be
9 the person buying that property, but the shed is
10 there so they're buying it knowingly. So in
11 theory, there wouldn't really be extensive impact
12 outside of that from our perspective.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank
14 you. From the city?

15 MR. HALL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
16 Yes. They are looking for four variances now.
17 Back in June 11th of this year you did grant three
18 variances for the same project. Just a point of
19 clarification for the shed. Was there a
20 demolition of some stuff that was tied into that?

21 MR. ROBINSON: Yes. That was one of
22 the agreements before we built this. There is a
23 structure there.

24 MR. ROBINSON: It's not a structure,
25 it's a patio, but it has like a grill and sink and

1 all that. We will demo that. We're happy to do
2 and we can do. So that's part of it that we can
3 do for sure.

4 MR. HALL: Great. So that will be
5 removed so it will be just be the second accessory
6 structure you're looking for.

7 MR. ROBINSON: That's correct.

8 MR. HALL: And then that structure, the
9 shed, I saw the floor plan you just had up there.
10 Was there any kind of plumbing or power or any
11 lights?

12 MR. ROBINSON: There would be power.
13 We need lighting in it and a daily external
14 lighting.

15 MR. HALL: And the external lighting
16 wouldn't be pointing to the road?

17 MR. ROBINSON: No. Superficial.

18 MR. HALL: So the having a second
19 accessory structure would be one variance. The
20 second variance would be a larger shed, so it
21 would be a 330 square foot shed 230 square foot,
22 100 square foot increase. The height of the shed
23 for 10.75 feet. So a foot .75 would be the
24 increase. What's coming before you today is
25 because they're not combining the lots. Last time

1 we approved this the lots would be combined, so
2 the bigger lot to look at. So a lot coverage
3 variance wasn't required because they're combining
4 the two lots. Now that they're not combining, the
5 lot coverage now comes into play. So now that's
6 the fourth variance they're asking for, and that's
7 a 3.57 increase, so it would be an 8.57% lot
8 coverage in total for the one lot, and that would
9 give them the ability to sell off the other
10 property if you would allow the lot coverage
11 increase. With that, thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
13 Appreciate it. Correspondence secretary.

14 MEMBER LONGO: Yes. We mailed out 24
15 correspondence, five were returned and one did
16 come back approved, your next door neighbor.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
18 Any public or anybody? Looks like none. Okay.
19 It's open to the board. Dr. Sanghvi.

20 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. I came and
21 visited your place last week, walked around. You
22 have a beautiful home and it's a very nice area
23 there. But the ball game changed after you
24 changed the shed. What are you going to do with
25 that that is sitting there already?

1 MR. ROBINSON: The patio? Tearing it
2 out.

3 MEMBER SANGHVI: You're going to tear
4 it down and put the whole thing new structure
5 there?

6 MR. ROBINSON: Yeah. All that will be
7 gone.

8 MEMBER SANGHVI: And increasing the
9 size of the shed as assigned by the ordinance. I
10 can understand your need, and I can support it.
11 Thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
13 Dr. Sanghvi. Any other board member? Linda,
14 please go ahead.

15 MEMBER KRIEGER: In the request in the
16 packet, it's 10.75 feet, but in the picture you've
17 got up there it was 12.5.

18 MR. ROBINSON: That's the median. Is
19 that how it works? At least that's how I
20 understand it.

21 MEMBER KRIEGER: All right. And then
22 the shed's going to be on the property where the
23 house is now?

24 MR. ROBINSON: That's correct.

25 MEMBER KRIEGER: Your house. Okay.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
2 Thank you, Linda. Any other board member? Yeah,
3 please, member Montague.

4 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Just like last time,
5 I assume you'll not put a bathroom over there.

6 MR. ROBINSON: That's already done.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: And you have
8 looked at the shed at least in terms of trying to
9 minimize what you need because the lot coverage is
10 now.

11 MR. ROBINSON: When we originally came,
12 I think that was 2020, we originally went for a
13 20-by-20 shed. So we did shrink it quite a bit
14 from that. We do have a breakdown in here just
15 breaking down some of the usage of this. So we
16 covered this last time, but we've ran into
17 multiple things. One, we've invested a lot into
18 the home so we wanted to really bring the
19 aesthetics. Having eight months of the year with
20 a dock and all of the things outside is an
21 eyesore. In the summer it's about storing things
22 for safety all of the things instead of carrying
23 them across the street. So this is taking that
24 into consideration.

25 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yeah. Just running

1 by there today I appreciate the stuff being
2 inside. I do appreciate the shed and I support
3 you.

4 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you
5 Member Montague. Member Longo?

6 MEMBER LONGO: In addition to the
7 variance subject to no bathroom also should be
8 subject to removal of the patio, whatever you call
9 it.

10 MR. ROBINSON: Yep.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you
12 Member Longo and Montague. Thank you. Any other
13 board member? Okay. It's time for a motion.
14 Member Linda.

15 MEMBER KRIEGER: In regard to the
16 structure, it's going to be 20 feet long so that's
17 the aesthetic view for neighbor's either side to
18 keep it so --

19 MR. ROBINSON: Actually it would be 20
20 feet wide from our view out of the house, but 16
21 and a half deep. So any of the neighbors, it
22 would actually impact them less because it's not
23 as deep.

24 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Go
25 ahead, Linda, for the motion.

1 MEMBER KRIEGER: In case number
2 PZ24-0058 for Josh and Erin Robinson on 1375 East
3 Lake, I move to grant the variance sought by
4 petitioner. They have shown practical difficulty
5 requiring request for variances. Variance is for
6 the 330 square foot shed, 100 is allowed.
7 Variance of 230 square feet to allow the 10.75
8 foot shed height, nine foot allowed, variance 1.75
9 square feet, to allow 8.57 lot coverage 5%
10 allowed, variance of 3.57%. That the -- without
11 the variance the petitioner will be unreasonably
12 prevented or limited with respect to use of the
13 property because of it being on a lakefront to
14 make it aesthetically pleasing by putting away all
15 the water dock and issues during the winter, and
16 in the summer having instead of crossing the
17 street as they stated, the water side issues would
18 be taken care of. That the property is unique
19 because it's a lakefront. The petitioner did not
20 create the condition because it is on the lake and
21 the topography and the two sites are continuing
22 that way. The relief granted will not
23 unreasonably interfere with adjacent or
24 surrounding properties because it would be
25 aesthetically pleasing for neighbors as they drive

1 by. The relief is consistent with the spirit and
2 intent of the ordinance because they also will
3 demolish the existing patio and for the
4 construction of the new structure.

5 MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

6 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Modify it and put
7 contingent upon no bathroom will be provided.

8 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. I agree to that
9 amendment. Contingent that there will not be any
10 plumbing or bathroom on the water side.

11 MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
13 Linda and Dr. Sanghvi. Roll call.

14 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

15 MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

16 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

17 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

18 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, ma'am.

20 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

21 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

22 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

23 MEMBER MCLEOD: Yes.

24 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

25 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

1 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

2 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

3 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion
4 carries.

5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
6 Congratulations. Any other matters before I
7 adjourn the meeting? Anybody have any other
8 matters, please?

9 MEMBER KRIEGER: I move to adjourn.

10 MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Any nays.
12 Say all in favor aye.

13 THE BOARD: Aye.

14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
15 and drive safe and good night.

16 (The meeting was concluded at 8:59 p.m.)

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE OF NOTARY

STATE OF MICHIGAN)
) SS
COUNTY OF OAKLAND)

I, Melinda R. Womack, Certified
Shorthand Reporter, a Notary Public in and for the
above county and state, do hereby certify that the
above deposition was taken before me at the time
and place hereinbefore set forth; that the witness
was by me first duly sworn to testify to the
truth, and nothing but the truth, that the
foregoing questions asked and answers made by the
witness were duly recorded by me stenographically
and reduced to computer transcription; that this
is a true, full and correct transcript of my
stenographic notes so taken; and that I am not
related to, nor of counsel to either party nor
interested in the event of this cause.

Melinda R. Womack, CSR-3611

Notary Public, Oakland County, Michigan

My Commission expires: 06-22-2025